

---

# CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxv</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxix</i>
<i>Special Notice</i>	<i>xxxv</i>

---

INTRODUCTION	1
A. The Career of a Criminal Case	1
1. Procedure Before Trial	2
Donald Dripps, Criminal Justice Process	2
2. Substantive Legal Issues Before Trial	5
3. Procedure at Trial	7
4. Substantive Legal Issues on Appeal	8
B. Sources of Criminal Law	9
1. Statutes	9
2. Precedent	10
3. Constitutions	12
C. The Analysis of Criminal Liability	14
1. The Purpose of Analysis	14
2. The Model Penal Code Scheme	15
3. The German Scheme	16
D. Burdens of Proof and Due Process	16

## **I**

---

### **JUST PUNISHMENT** **21**

Colorado Revised Statutes	26
---------------------------	----

## 1

---

THE PURPOSES AND LIMITS OF PUNISHMENT	29
A. An Introductory Problem	29
Notes and Questions	30
B. Utilitarianism and Retributivism	31
John Braithwaite and Philip Pettit, Not Just Deserts: A Republican Theory of Criminal Justice	32
C. Utilitarian Punishment	34
1. The Utility Principle as a Limit on Punishment	34
Jeremy Bentham, The Theory of Legislation	34
2. Deterrence	35
Jeremy Bentham, The Theory of Legislation	35
James Q. Wilson, Thinking About Crime	36
Anthony N. Doob & Cheryl Marie Webster, Sentence Severity and Crime: Accepting the Null Hypothesis	38
Louis Seidman, Soldiers, Martyrs, and Criminal Law: Utilitarianism and the Problem of Crime Control	39
Dan M. Kahan, Social Influence, Social Meaning, and Deterrence	40
Notes and Questions	42
3. Rehabilitation	44
David Rothman, The Discovery of the Asylum	44
Edward L. Rubin, The Inevitability of Rehabilitation	47
Francis A. Allen, Criminal Justice, Legal Values, and the Rehabilitative Ideal	48
Elliot Currie, Confronting Crime: An American Challenge	48
Michael Tonry, Malign Neglect: Race, Crime, and Punishment in America	49
Notes and Questions	49
4. Incapacitation	50
James Q. Wilson, Thinking About Crime	50
Alfred Blumstein and Jacqueline Cohen, Characterizing Criminal Careers	53
Franklin E. Zimring and Gordon Hawkins, Incapacitation: Penal Confinement and the Restraint of Crime	54
Markus Dirk Dubber, Recidivist Statutes as Arational Punishment	55
Notes and Questions	55
D. Retribution	58
1. Retribution as a Limit on Punishment	58
H.J. McCloskey, A Non-Utilitarian Approach to Punishment	58
John Rawls, Two Concepts of Rules	59
Guyora Binder & Nicholas J. Smith, Framed: Utilitarianism and Punishment of the Innocent	59
Herbert Packer, The Limits of the Criminal Sanction	60
Alan H. Goldman, The Paradox of Punishment	61
David Dolinko, Three Mistakes of Retributivism	61
Michael L. Corrado, The Abolition of Punishment	62
<i>Kansas v. Hendricks</i>	63
Notes and Questions	65

2. Retribution as an Affirmative Justification for Punishment	66
a. The Appeal to Intuition	66
Michael Moore, Law and Psychiatry	66
Notes and Questions	66
b. The Argument from Social Contract	67
Herbert Morris, On Guilt and Innocence	67
Jeffrie Murphy, Marxism and Retribution	68
Notes and Questions	68
c. The Expressive Argument	69
Joel Feinberg, Doing and Deserving	69
Jean Hampton, Punishment as Defeat	70
Notes and Questions	71
E. Beyond Utility and Desert: Educative Theories of Punishment	71
Herbert Morris, A Paternalistic Theory of Punishment	72
R.A. Duff, Trials and Punishments	73
John Braithwaite, Crime, Shame, and Reintegration	74
Notes and Questions	75
F. Proportionality	75
<i>Ewing v. California</i>	75
Notes and Questions	79
G. Modern Guidelines Sentencing	83
Kevin Reitz, Sentencing: Guidelines	86
1. Due Process, the Jury, and Sentencing Designs	91
<i>Apprendi v. New Jersey</i>	91
Notes and Questions	95
2. The <i>Blakeley-Booker</i> Revolution in Sentencing	95

## II

---

### THE ELEMENTS OF THE CRIMINAL OFFENSE 103

#### 2

---

### THE CRIMINAL ACT 105

A. The Need for an Actus Reus	107
<i>Proctor v. State</i>	107
Notes and Questions	110
B. Omissions	111
Notes and Questions	113
C. Possession	115
<i>United States v. Maldonado</i>	115
Notes and Questions	118
D. The Requirement of Harm	123
<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	124
Notes and Questions	129
E. The Requirement of Voluntariness	131
<i>People v. Newton</i>	131
Notes and Questions	132

	<i>Martin v. State</i>	132
	Notes and Questions	133
	<i>People v. Grant</i>	134
	Notes and Questions	137
F.	The Prohibition of “Status” Crimes	140
	<i>Robinson v. California</i>	140
	Notes and Questions	141
	<i>Johnson v. State</i>	145
	Notes and Questions	148
G.	Legality	149
	<i>United States v. Hudson and Goodwin</i>	149
	Notes and Questions	150
	<i>State v. Egan</i>	151
	Notes and Questions	153
	<i>Rogers v. Tennessee</i>	155
	Notes and Questions	159
H.	Specificity	163
	<i>Chicago v. Morales</i>	163
	Notes and Questions	167

## 3

---

 THE GUILTY MIND 175

A.	The Requirement of a Guilty Mind	178
	<i>People v. Dillard</i>	178
	Notes and Questions	181
	<i>United States v. Wulff</i>	186
	Notes and Questions	188
	<i>Lambert v. California</i>	193
	Notes and Questions	195
B.	Categories of Culpability	198
	<i>Regina v. Faulkner</i>	198
	Notes and Questions	200
	Model Penal Code §§1.13 and 2.02	206
	Notes and Questions	207
C.	Mistake and Mens Rea Default Rules	213
	<i>Regina v. Prince</i>	213
	Notes and Questions	217
	<i>People v. Ryan</i>	219
	Notes and Questions	222
D.	“Mistake of Law”	229
	1. Introduction to Mistake of Law	229
	2. Mistake of Law and Mens Rea	231
	<i>People v. Bray</i>	231
	Notes and Questions	233
	<i>United States v. Baker</i>	235
	Notes and Questions	236
	<i>Cheek v. United States</i>	237
	Notes and Questions	241

3. Mistake of Law as an Excuse	242
<i>Commonwealth v. Twitchell</i>	242
Notes and Questions	244
E. Capacity for Mens Rea	247
<i>Hendershott v. People</i>	247
Notes and Questions	250
<i>State v. Cameron</i>	252
Notes and Questions	255
<i>Montana v. Egelhoff</i>	256
Notes and Questions	257

4

---

CAUSATION

A. “But-For” Causation	262
<i>Regina v. Martin Dyos</i>	262
Notes and Questions	264
<i>R. v. Bengé</i>	269
Notes and Questions	271
B. Violent Acts	272
<i>Hubbard v. Commonwealth</i>	272
Notes and Questions	274
C. Proximate Cause: Forseeability and Related Limitations	275
<i>Commonwealth v. Rhoades</i>	275
Notes and Questions	277
D. Intervening Causes	281
<i>Commonwealth v. Root</i>	281
Notes and Questions	284
<i>United States v. Hamilton</i>	287
Notes and Questions	290
<i>Stephenson v. State</i>	293
Notes and Questions	295
<i>People v. Kevorkian</i>	297
Notes and Questions	301
E. Causation by Omission: Duties	302
<i>People v. Beardsley</i>	302
Notes and Questions	304

III

---

HOMICIDE OFFENSES

Kan. Stat. Ann. §§21-3401 through 21-3405	311
Ala. Code §§13A-6-2 through 13A-6-4	312
Cal. Penal Code §§187 through 189, 191 through 192	313
Pa. Cons. Stat. Ann., Title 18, §§2502 through 2504, 2506	315

Illinois Compiled Statutes Ann. 720 ILCS 5/9-1 through 720 ILCS 5/9-2	316
Minnesota Statues Ann. 609.185	317
Model Penal Code §§210.2 through 210.4	318
New York Penal Code §§125.10, 125.12, 125.15, 125.20, 125.25, 125.27	319

## 5

---

 INTENTIONAL HOMICIDE 325

A. Intentional Murder (Second Degree)	325
<i>Francis v. Franklin</i>	325
Notes and Questions	328
B. Premeditated Murder (First Degree)	330
<i>United States v. Watson</i>	330
Notes and Questions	334
C. Voluntary Manslaughter	340
1. The Theory of Mitigation	340
<i>People v. Walker</i>	340
Notes and Questions	342
2. “Cooling Time”	346
<i>Ex Parte Fraley</i>	346
Notes and Questions	347
3. The Common Law and Its Categories and Rules	350
a. Adultery and Other “Adequate Provocations”	350
<i>Rowland v. State</i>	350
Notes and Questions	352
b. Provocation Under Reform Rules	358
<i>People v. Berry</i>	358
Notes and Questions	361
4. Cultural Norms and the Reasonable Person	369
<i>People v. Wu</i>	369
Notes and Questions	378

## 6

---

 UNINTENTIONAL HOMICIDE 381

A. Involuntary Manslaughter	381
1. Negligent and Reckless Homicide	381
<i>Commonwealth v. Welansky</i>	381
Notes and Questions	385
2. Involuntary Manslaughter in Contemporary Settings	390
<i>State v. Williams</i>	390
Notes and Questions	393
B. Reckless Murder	400
<i>Mayer v. People</i>	400
Notes and Questions	403

C. Homicide in the Course of Another Crime	413
1. Felony Murder: An Introduction	413
<i>State v. Martin</i>	413
Notes and Questions	418
2. Causal Limitations	427
<i>People v. Hickman</i>	427
Notes and Questions	429
<i>People v. Gladman</i>	432
Notes and Questions	435
<i>People v. Cavitt</i>	436
Notes and Questions	439
3. Dangerous Felony Limitations	439
4. The Independent Felonious Purpose Limitation	442
<i>State v. Shock</i>	442
Notes and Questions	446
5. Two Variants of Felony Murder	448
a. Misdemeanor Manslaughter	448
b. Death-Aggravated Felonies	450

7

---

CAPITAL MURDER AND THE DEATH PENALTY 453

A. A Historical and Constitutional Summary	453
B. The New Capital Statutes	459
1. The Structure of “Guided Discretion”: An Exemplary Case	460
<i>Olsen v. State</i>	460
Notes and Questions	470
2. Mitigating Circumstances	476
3. Weighing the Circumstances	479
C. Categorical Limits on the Death Penalty	483
1. The Mens Rea Limit: A Reprise on Felony Murder	483
<i>Tison v. Arizona</i>	483
Notes and Questions	488
2. Status Limitations on the Death Penalty: Mental Retardation and Youth	491
Notes and Questions	493
3. Victim/Race Discrimination and the Eighth Amendment	497
<i>McCleskey v. Kemp</i>	497
Notes and Questions	502

**IV**

---

JUSTIFICATION AND EXCUSE 507

A. Distinguishing Justification and Excuse	507
B. Justification, Excuse, and the Purposes of Punishment	509
C. Combining Justification and Excuse	513

---

DEFENSIVE FORCE, NECESSITY, AND DURESS	515
A. Defensive Force	515
1. Elements and Rationales	515
<i>People v. La Voie</i>	515
Notes and Questions	517
<i>People v. Gleghorn</i>	520
Notes and Questions	522
2. The Reasonable Self-Defender: The Case of the Battered Spouse	523
<i>State v. Leidholm</i>	523
Notes and Questions	531
3. Reprise on the Reasonable Self-Defender	545
<i>People v. Goetz</i>	545
Notes and Questions	549
The Case of <i>People v. Abbott</i>	549
Notes and Questions	551
4. Defensive Force and Law Enforcement	552
<i>Tennessee v. Garner</i>	553
Notes and Questions	556
<i>People v. Ceballos</i>	559
Notes and Questions	562
B. Choice of Evils — Necessity	563
1. The Moral Issue	563
<i>The Queen v. Dudley &amp; Stephens</i>	563
Notes and Questions	568
2. Escape from Intolerable Prison Conditions	574
<i>People v. Unger</i>	574
Notes and Questions	577
3. “Political” Necessity	578
<i>State v. Warshow</i>	578
Notes and Questions	581
C. Duress	584
<i>State v. Crawford</i>	584
Notes and Questions	590
<i>State v. Hunter</i>	596
Notes and Questions	599

---

MENTAL ILLNESS AS A DEFENSE	605
A. Introduction	605
B. The <i>M’Naghten</i> Rule and Cognition	607
<i>People v. Serravo</i>	607
Notes and Questions	617

C.	Cognition and Volition: The Road from <i>M’Naghten</i> and Back	624
	<i>Smith v. State</i>	627
	Notes and Questions	631
D.	Reprise: Reassessing the Insanity Defense	642
	1. The Continuing Debate over Abolition	642
	2. Insanity, the Psychopath, and the Challenge of Biology	644
E.	“Quasi-Insanity” Defenses	646
	1. Alcohol and Other Drugs	646
	2. Specific Disorders	648
	a. Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder	648
	b. Postpartum Psychosis	650
	c. Gambling	651
	d. “Multiple Personality” Disorder	651
F.	“Diminished Capacity”	653
	Notes and Questions	655

**V**

---

**ATTRIBUTION OF CRIMINALITY** **657**

10

---

**ATTEMPT** **659**

A.	The Punishment for Attempt	659
	1. Why Punish Attempt?	659
	2. The Emergence of Attempt Liability	660
	George Fletcher, Rethinking Criminal Law	660
	3. The Grading of Attempt	661
	Model Penal Code §5.05	661
	Notes and Questions	661
B.	The Mens Rea for Attempt	664
	<i>State v. Lyerla</i>	664
	Notes and Questions	666
C.	The Actus Reus of Attempt	670
	1. Preparation vs. Attempt	670
	<i>People v. Murray</i>	670
	Notes and Questions	671
	<i>McQuirter v. State</i>	674
	Notes and Questions	675
	<i>People v. Rizzo</i>	676
	Notes and Questions	679
	2. Abandonment	684
	<i>People v. Staples</i>	684
	Notes and Questions	686
	3. Solicitation	689
	<i>People v. Lubow</i>	689
	Notes and Questions	691

D. Impossibility	694
<i>Booth v. State</i>	694
Notes and Questions	700
<i>People v. Dlugash</i>	706
Notes and Questions	709
<i>People v. Thousand</i>	710
Notes and Questions	712

## 11

---

 COMPLICITY 715

A. The Accessorial Act	718
<i>State v. Ochoa</i>	718
Notes and Questions	723
<i>State v. Tally</i>	730
Notes and Questions	739
B. Mens Rea of Complicity	743
1. Intent to Aid or Encourage	745
<i>People v. Beeman</i>	745
Notes and Questions	748
2. The Mental Element of the Offense	753
<i>Wilson v. People</i>	753
Notes and Questions	756
3. Combined Standards and Unintended Harm	757
<i>State v. Etzweiler</i>	757
Notes and Questions	759
C. Act and Mens Rea: An Exercise	762
The Killing of Yusuf Hawkins	762
Notes and Questions	766
D. Relations of Parties	767
1. The Perpetrator Is Excused	767
2. The Perpetrator Is Justified	768
3. The Perpetrator Lacks Mens Rea	769
4. Discrepant Mens Rea	770
5. One of the Parties Lacks a Required Status for the Crime	772
E. The “Straw Man” Gun Purchase: A Closing Exercise on Complicity	777
F. Criminal Liability of Corporations	780
1. Respondeat Superior and the Premises of Corporate Liability	781
<i>State v. Christy Pontiac-GMC, Inc.</i>	781
Notes and Questions	783
<i>United States v. Hilton Hotels Corp.</i>	785
Notes and Questions	787
2. The MPC and the “Corporate Mind”	787
Notes and Questions	788

---

CONSPIRACY 791

A. The Nature of Conspiracy	792
<i>State v. Verive</i>	792
Notes and Questions	794
B. The Agreement	800
1. Proof of Formation	800
<i>Griffin v. State</i>	800
Notes and Questions	802
<i>United States v. Zacarias Moussaoui</i>	806
2. Termination of the Agreement	809
<i>United States v. Recio</i>	809
Notes and Questions	811
C. The Mens Rea of Conspiracy	812
<i>People v. Lauria</i>	812
Notes and Questions	819
D. Special Mens Rea Problems of Conspiracy	821
E. The Incidents of Conspiracy	823
<i>United States v. Diaz</i>	823
Notes and Questions	825
F. The Parties to and Objects of Conspiracy	833
1. Bilateral and Unilateral Conspiracies	833
2. The Scope of the Conspiracy	839
a. Single vs. Multiple Conspiracies	839
Jerome Campana, Chains, Wheels, and the Single Conspiracy	839
G. The RICO Statute and the Frontier of Conspiracy	846
1. The Statute	846
a. Section 1962(a) Violations	848
b. Section 1962(b) Violations	848
c. Section 1962(c) Violations	849
2. The Enterprise Concept	849
3. The “Pattern” Requirement	852
4. RICO Conspiracies	854
<i>United States v. Neapolitan</i>	855
Notes and Questions	857

**VI**

---

**ADDITIONAL OFFENSES 861**

---

RAPE 863

A. Introduction	863
1. Defining Rape	863
2. Some Facts About Rape in the United States	864
3. The Evolution of Rape Rules	866

B.	The Requirement of “Utmost Resistance”	869
	<i>Brown v. State</i>	869
	Notes and Questions	870
C.	“Reasonable” or “Earnest” Resistance	872
	<i>People v. Dorsey</i>	872
	Notes and Questions	876
D.	Force	878
	<i>People v. Barnes</i>	878
	Notes and Questions	884
E.	Nonconsent	890
	<i>State v. Smith</i>	890
	Notes and Questions	893
F.	Lack of Affirmative Expression of Consent	896
	<i>In the Interest of M.T.S.</i>	896
	Notes and Questions	902
G.	Incapacity to Consent	903
	<i>State v. Moorman</i>	903
	Notes and Questions	905
H.	Rape by Extortion	908
	<i>Commonwealth v. Mlinarich</i>	908
	Notes and Questions	910
I.	Rape by Fraud	912
	<i>Boro v. People</i>	912
	Notes and Questions	914
J.	Mens Rea	917
	<i>Commonwealth v. Fischer</i>	917
	Notes and Questions	923
K.	Evidentiary Reforms	927
L.	Marital Rape	934
	<i>People v. Liberta</i>	934
	Notes and Questions	937

## 14

---

 THEFT OFFENSES

939

A.	Theft	939
1.	The Meaning of Theft	939
	<i>Commonwealth v. Mitchneck</i>	939
	Notes and Questions	940
2.	The Development of Theft Offenses	940
	The Case of the Carrier Who Broke Bulk	942
	<i>Rex v. Chisser</i>	943
	<i>The King v. Pear</i>	943
	Notes and Questions	944
B.	Fraud	954
1.	False Pretenses	954
	<i>People v. Sattlekau</i>	954
	Notes and Questions	958

2. Scheme to Defraud in Federal Law	958
<i>Durland v. United States</i>	959
Notes and Questions	961
<i>United States v. Rybicki</i>	967
Notes and Questions	971
C. Extortion	971
<i>People v. Dioguardi</i>	971
Notes and Questions	975
<i>McCormick v. United States</i>	979
Notes and Questions	982
D. Robbery	984
<i>Lear v. State</i>	984
Notes and Questions	986
E. Burglary	988
<i>State v. Colvin</i>	989
Notes and Questions	991

15

---

PERJURY, FALSE STATEMENTS, AND OBSTRUCTION OF JUSTICE 995

A. Perjury	995
<i>Bronston v. United States</i>	996
Notes and Questions	1000
Stuart Green, Lying, Misleading, and Falsely Denying: How Moral Concepts Inform the Law of Perjury, Fraud, and False Statements	1001
Notes and Questions	1006
B. False Statements	1007
<i>Brogan v. United States</i>	1007
Notes and Questions	1010
C. Obstruction of Justice	1010
1. The Omnibus Provision — §1503	1011
<i>United States v. Aguilar</i>	1011
Notes and Questions	1015
<i>United States v. Cueto</i>	1015
Notes and Questions	1022
2. Section 1512 and the <i>Arthur Andersen</i> Case	1023
<i>Arthur Andersen LLP v. United States</i>	1024
Notes and Questions	1027

Appendix A

---

A NOTE ON THE MODEL PENAL CODE 1031

McClain and Dan Kahan, Criminal Law Reform: Historical Development in the United States	1031
--	------

## Appendix B

---

THE MODEL PENAL CODE	1035
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>1091</i>
<i>Table of Model Penal Code Sections</i>	<i>1099</i>
<i>Index</i>	<i>1101</i>