

# Contents

---

---

Why It's Important: A Preface for Students	xxiii
Acknowledgments	xxvii
A Word About Case Editing	xxix
<b>Chapter I</b> <b>Where Do “Ethics” Rules Come From?</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Part One</b>	
<hr/> <hr/> <b>THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT RELATIONSHIP</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>Chapter II</b> <b>Defining the Attorney-Client Relationship</b>	<b>23</b>
A. Is There a Client Here?	24
B. What do Lawyers Owe Clients	28
1. Competence	28
2. Confidentiality	29
“The Case of the Innocent Lifer”	29
“My Client Is HIV Positive”	30
“All’s Not Well”	31
<i>Perez v. Kirk &amp; Carrigan</i>	32
Privileged and Ethically Protected Information: What’s the Difference?	35
Policies Behind Privilege and Confidentiality Rules	37
Entity Clients	39
“Slip and Fall”	39
<i>Upjohn Co. v. United States</i>	40
<i>Samaritan Foundation v. Goodfarb</i>	43
The Restatement’s Position	48
What’s the Right Policy?	48
Is There a Government Attorney-Client Privilege?	50
Exceptions to the Privilege or the Ethical Duty	53
3. Agency	68
<i>Taylor v. Illinois</i>	69
<i>S.E.C. v. McNulty</i>	70
Binding the Client	72
Confidentiality Duties in Agency Law	75
4. Fiduciary	76
5. Loyalty and Diligence	78

6.	The Duty to Inform and Advise	79
	<i>Nichols v. Keller</i>	79
	Robert S. Caine, A Lawyer’s View of Being a Litigant	82
	The Client’s Right to Know	83
	“In a Box”	84
	“What Are the Odds?”	85
C.	Autonomy of Attorneys and Clients	86
1.	The Lawyer’s Autonomy	87
	“Ms. Niceperson”	87
	“I Don’t Plea Bargain”	88
	<i>Jones v. Barnes</i>	89
	The Scope of the Lawyer’s Autonomy	93
2.	The Client’s Autonomy	95
	“Memorandum from General Counsel: Diversity in Staffing”	95
	“I’d Rather Die”	95
	“Accept the Offer”	96
	<i>Olfe v. Gordon</i>	97
	The Scope of the Client’s Autonomy	98
	Clients with Diminished Capacity	100
D.	Terminating the Relationship	103
1.	Termination by the Client	103
2.	Termination by the Lawyer	104
3.	Termination by Drift	105
<b>Chapter III</b>	<b>Protecting the Attorney-Client Relationship Against Invasion</b>	<b>107</b>
A.	Communicating with Another Lawyer’s Clients	108
1.	Civil Matters	111
	“Slip and Fall Redux”	111
	<i>Niesig v. Team I</i>	111
	How Large the Circle of Secrecy?	115
	When the Government Is the Adversary	117
	Testers	119
2.	Criminal Matters	121
	“The Case of the Cooperating Target”	121
	<i>United States v. Hammad</i>	123
	Ethics and Crime Fighting in a Federal System	126
B.	Improper or Accidental Acquisition of Confidential Information	131
	“Something You Should Know”	131
	<i>Rico v. Mitsubishi Motors Corp.</i>	131
<b>Chapter IV</b>	<b>Lawyers, Money, and the Ethics of Legal Fees</b>	<b>141</b>
A.	The Role of the Marketplace	144
	<i>Brobeck, Phleger &amp; Harrison v. Telex Corp.</i>	144
	Time or Value (or does Value = Time)?	148
B.	Unethical Fees	151
	“What Are You Worth?”	151

	<i>Matter of Laurence S. Fordham</i>	152
	Courts May Reduce or Deny Unethical Fees	159
	Should a Lawyer Be Required to Put Fee Agreements in Writing?	160
	Inflating Bills	160
	Nonrefundable Fees and Liquidated Damage Clauses in Retainer Agreements	161
	“Meet Sara Bennet”	161
	<i>Matter of Cooperman</i>	162
	A Lawyer’s Inventory	164
	<i>McQueen, Rains, &amp; Tresch LLP v. Citgo Petroleum Corp.</i>	165
C.	Contingent Fees	168
	Contingent Fees and Conflicts of Interest	170
	Prohibitions on Contingent Fees in Criminal and Matrimonial Cases	171
	Should Contingent Fees Be Outlawed or Further Regulated?	172
	“Petra Bento’s Hybrid Fee Agreement”	175
D.	Minimum Fee Schedules	175
	<i>Goldfarb v. Virginia State Bar</i>	176
	Antitrust and Legal Ethics	178
E.	Court-Awarded Fees	179
	1. What’s the Right Amount?	179
	“Those Fees Are Outrageous”	180
	2. Settlement Conditioned on Fee Waiver	181
	<i>Evans v. Jeff D.</i>	181
	Questions About <i>Evans v. Jeff D.</i>	190
	3. Who May Receive Court-Ordered Fees?	193
F.	Mandatory Pro Bono Plans	194
	“Should We Adopt Mandatory Pro Bono?”	194
	Deborah L. Rhode, Cultures of Commitment: Pro Bono for Lawyers and Law Students	197
	Jonathan R. Macey, Mandatory Pro Bono: Comfort for the Poor or Welfare for the Rich?	199
	Dennis Jacobs, Pro Bono for Fun and Profit	203
G.	Who Gets the Money?	204
	Dividing Money (or Clients) Within a Firm	205
	Division of Fees Outside Firms	208
	What Is a Law Firm?	209

## Part Two

---

	<b>CONFLICTS OF INTEREST</b>	<b>211</b>
<b>Chapter V</b>	<b>Concurrent Conflicts of Interest</b>	<b>213</b>
	A Typology of Conflicts	214
	The Competing Interests	219

A.	Client-Lawyer Conflicts	220
1.	Business Interests	220
	“Lawyer. Realtor. Any Problem?”	220
	“My Opponent’s Firm is an Occasional Client”	220
	<i>Matter of Neville</i>	221
	A Lawyer’s Financial Interests	223
2.	Media Rights	227
3.	Financial Assistance and Proprietary Interests	229
4.	Fee-Payer Interests	231
5.	Related Lawyers, Significant Others, and Friends	232
	<i>Gellman v. Hilal</i>	232
	Private and Public Lives	234
6.	A Lawyer’s Legal Exposure	235
	“The Client Says We Messed Up”	235
7.	Gender, Religion, Race	237
	“Karen Horowitz’s Dilemma”	237
	How Roger Baldwin Picked a Lawyer	239
B.	Client-Client Conflicts	241
1.	Criminal Cases (Defense Lawyers)	241
	“Murder One, Murder Two”	241
	“Did Officer Schwarz Get the Effective Assistance of Counsel?”	242
	<i>Cuyler v. Sullivan</i>	244
	Turning Conflicts into Sixth Amendment Claims After <i>Cuyler</i>	248
	<i>Holloway</i> Error	250
	Disqualification of Defense Counsel	251
	“Murder at the Ballgame”	252
	<i>Wheat v. United States</i>	253
	<i>Wheat’s</i> Harvest	260
	Criminal Case Disqualification and the “Automatic Reversal” Debate	261
2.	Criminal Cases (Prosecutors)	263
	“Contributions to Justice”	263
	“A Reasonable Doubt”	264
	<i>Young v. United States ex rel. Vuitton et Fils S.A.</i>	265
	Prosecutors avec Deux Chapeaux	267
3.	Civil Cases	271
	“Will You Represent Us Both?”	271
	“They’re On the Same Page”	271
	“May We Do Both Cases?”	272
	<i>Fiandaca v. Cunningham</i>	272
	Imputed Conflicts	276
	Standing to Object	278
	May a Lawyer Act Adversely to a Client on an Unrelated Matter?	279
	Confidentiality and Privilege in Multiple Client Representations	282
	Class Conflicts	287

Appealability of Civil Disqualification Orders	288
Malpractice Based on Conflicts	289
<i>Simpson v. James</i>	289
What Did Oliver and James Do Wrong?	292
Consent and Waiver	293
“What Kind of Consent?”	293
Is There a Client-Lawyer Relationship?	296
4. The Insurance Triangle	299
“The Insurer Would Want to Know”	299
<i>Public Service Mutual Insurance Co. v. Goldfarb</i>	300
Client Identity and the Obligation to Defend	302
C. The Advocate-Witness Rule	305
Policies Behind the Advocate-Witness Rule	305
The Advocate-Witness Rule in Criminal Cases	307
<b>Chapter VI</b>	<b>Successive Conflicts of Interest</b>
	<b>309</b>
A. Private Practice	309
“Divorce and Default”	309
“Do I Still Owe the Record Store?”	310
<i>Analytica, Inc. v. NPD Research, Inc.</i>	310
The “Substantial Relationship” Test	314
Can “Playbook” Create a Substantial Relationship?	316
The Loyalty Duty to Former Clients (or It’s Not Only About Confidences)	318
The Consequences of Disqualification	320
Malpractice Based on Successive Conflicts	321
Who Is a Former Client?	321
Like a Hot Potato	322
Standing and Waiver	326
The Appearance of Impropriety	326
Conflicts in Class Actions	328
B. Imputed Disqualification and Migratory Lawyers	329
“You Don’t Know Anything”	329
“Can We Hire Taylor Monk?”	329
<i>Cromley v. Board of Education</i>	331
Why Didn’t the <i>Cromley</i> Court Inquire . . . ?	334
Presumptions in Imputed Disqualification	335
Removing Conflicts from a Former Firm	339
Rebutting the Second Presumption	340
Nonlawyer Conflicts	341
Reflections on the Term “Chinese Wall”	342
C. Government Service	343
“Investigating Landlords”	343
<i>Armstrong v. McAlpin</i>	344
The Revolving Door in the Model Rules	347

---



---

**Part Three**

<b>SPECIAL LAWYER ROLES</b>	<b>351</b>
<b>Chapter VII Ethics in Advocacy</b>	<b>353</b>
A. Four Views of Adversary Justice	358
Anthony Trollope, <i>Orley Farm</i>	358
Simon H. Rifkind, <i>The Lawyer's Role and Responsibility in Modern Society</i>	359
Marvin E. Frankel, <i>Partisan Justice</i>	363
The Advocate as Performance Artist	366
Robert C. Post, <i>On the Popular Image of the Lawyer: Reflections in a Dark Glass</i>	367
"Which System Is Better?"	371
B. Are Lawyers Ever Morally Accountable for Their Clients?	372
Cravath Represents Credit Suisse	372
Ronald Goldfarb, <i>Lawyers Should Be Judged by the Clients They Keep</i>	373
C. Truth and Confidences	376
"Out Carousing with Mikey"	376
Legislative History of the Code	379
Legislative History of the Rules	380
<i>Nix v. Whiteside</i>	381
After <i>Nix</i> , What?	389
"The Lecture"	394
Ethics, Lies, and Rule 26	398
Robert Bennett's Letter to Judge Susan Webber Wright	399
Summary: Variables in Analyzing Issues Concerning Witness Perjury	400
D. Fostering Falsity or Advancing Truth?	401
1. Literal Truth	402
a. The Parable of Billy	402
b. The Romance of Annie and Bill	402
c. The Two Boys and the Butcher	403
d. In the Matter of William Jefferson Clinton	404
e. The Law of Perjury	407
f. The Law of Contempt	409
"Did You Communicate with Cassie?"	410
2. Cross-Examining the Truthful Witness	411
Daniel J. Kornstein, <i>A Tragic Fire — A Great Cross-Examination</i>	412
Ann Ruben & Emily Ruben, <i>Letter to the Editor</i>	414
3. Appeals to Bias	416
4. The Boundaries of Proper Argument	419
Improper Argument	419
Arguing for False Inferences	420
"The Eyewitness" (Part I)	420
"The Eyewitness" (Part II)	421

William H. Fortune, Richard H. Underwood & Edward J. Imwinkelried, <i>Modern Litigation and Professional Responsibility Handbook</i>	422
The Subin-Mitchell Debate	424
Questions	429
“Maxwell’s Silver Handle .38”	430
E. Frivolous Positions and Abusive Tactics	431
F. Dilatory Tactics	434
Washington Monthly	434
G. Hardball and Incivility	435
<i>Mullaney v. Aude</i>	437
H. Misstating Facts, Precedent, or the Record	441
I. The Obligation to Reveal Adverse Legal Authority	443
<i>Matter of Thonert</i>	443
Is There an Obligation to Reveal That Your Client Has No Case?	446
<b>Chapter VIII      Special Issues in Litigation</b>	<b>449</b>
A. Real and Electronic Evidence	449
“Reliable Sources Say”	449
“Vanity Ink”	450
Real Evidence and Legal Ethics	453
<i>In re Ryder</i>	453
Real Evidence and Criminal Law	457
Real Evidence and the Attorney-Client Privilege	462
<i>People v. Meredith</i>	462
The Turnover Duty (But How Broad?)	468
Moving Pictures	469
Does the Source Matter?	470
A Lawyer’s E-Discovery Obligations	471
<i>Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC</i>	471
B. Some Issues Concerning Prosecutors	474
1. Public Comments that Deny a Fair Trial	475
<i>Jovanovic v. City of New York</i>	476
Questions About <i>Jovanovic</i>	482
2. Ethical Issues in Making the Charging Decision	484
“People v. Anita Winslow”	485
“Conviction or Compensation”	488
3. Throwing a Case (in the Interests of Justice?)	489
Benjamin Weiser, <i>Doubting Case, A Prosecutor         Helped The Defense</i>	489
Reaction in the Blogosphere	493
Robert Morgenthau, <i>Letter to the Editor</i>	499
Questions About the Bibb Story	500
<b>Chapter IX      Negotiation and Transactional Matters</b>	<b>503</b>
“The Bad Builder’s Good Lawyer”	504
“The Case of the Complex Formula”	506
<i>Fire Insurance Exchange v. Bell</i>	512

	<i>Hoyt Properties, Inc. v. Production Resources Group, L.L.C.</i>	514
	<i>Virzi v. Grand Trunk Warehouse and Cold Storage Co.</i>	517
	What Does <i>Virzi</i> Stand For?	520
	<i>The Florida Bar v. Belleville</i>	522
	Negotiating with an Unrepresented and Dangerous Fugitive	524
	Threatening Criminal Prosecution or Discipline	526
<b>Chapter X</b>	<b>Lawyers for Companies and Other Organizations</b>	<b>529</b>
A.	Conflicts and Confidentiality in Entity Representation	534
	“I Never Worked for the Buyer”	534
	<i>Tekni-Plex, Inc. v. Meyner &amp; Landis</i>	535
	Internal Investigations	541
	<i>In re Grand Jury Subpoena</i>	542
	“Who’s Your Client?” (Reprise)	547
	Corporate Officers and Employees	548
	Partnerships	551
	Privilege and Conflicts in Shareholder (and Other Fiduciary) Actions	552
	Members of Corporate Families	554
	Closely Held Entities	561
	<i>Murphy &amp; Demory, Ltd., et al. v. Admiral Daniel J. Murphy, U.S.N. (Ret.), et al.</i>	561
B.	Retaliatory Discharge and Whistleblowing	564
	“Contraindications”	564
	<i>Crews v. Buckman Laboratories International, Inc.</i>	567
	Traditional Doctrine Confronts Economic Reality	575
	The Rights of Associates	579
C.	Sarbanes-Oxley and the Rule 1.13 Amendments	580
<b>Chapter XI</b>	<b>Judges</b>	<b>585</b>
A.	Conflicts and Disqualification	589
	“Conflicts in <i>Bush v. Gore</i> ?”	589
	“The Clients of My Daughter Mean Nothing to Me”	589
	What Judicial Conflicts Violate the Due Process Clause?	590
	Ethical and Statutory Disqualification	592
	<i>Liljeberg v. Health Services Acquisition Corp.</i>	592
	What Conflicts Prevent a Judge from Sitting?	602
B.	Expressions of Gender, Racial, and Other Bias	618
	“The Judge and the Boy Scouts”	618
	Judicial and Courtroom Bias	619
	<i>In re Marriage of Iverson</i>	619
	<i>Matter of Bourisseau</i>	622
	Statements Off the Bench	625
	What the Code Requires	627

## Part Four

---

**AVOIDING AND REDRESSING PROFESSIONAL FAILURE** **631**


---

<b>Chapter XII</b>	<b>Control of Quality: Reducing the Likelihood of Professional Failure</b>	<b>633</b>
A.	Admission to the Bar	635
1.	Geographical Exclusion	636
	<i>Supreme Court of New Hampshire v. Piper</i>	637
	The “New Jersey” Problem	642
2.	Geographical Restriction	643
	<i>Supreme Court of Virginia v. Friedman</i>	643
	After <i>Piper</i> and <i>Friedman</i> , What Can a State Do to Discourage Out-of-State Lawyers?	647
3.	Education and Examination	648
4.	Character Inquiries	649
	“Shattered Glass”	649
	<i>In re Mustafa</i>	651
	Frequently Cited Grounds for Delaying or Denying Admission to the Bar	653
	“The Racist Bar Applicant”	657
	Procedures Regarding Character Inquiry	657
5.	Admission in a Federal System	658
B.	Transient Lawyers and Multijurisdictional Firms: Local Interests Confront a National Bar	660
1.	Admissions Pro Hac Vice	663
	<i>Leis v. Flynt</i>	663
	What About the Client’s Interests?	669
2.	Services Other Than Litigation	670
	“Local Office, National Practice”	670
	<i>Birbrower, Montalbano, Condon &amp; Frank, P.C. v. Superior Court</i>	672
	If <i>Birbrower</i> Is the Problem, What Is the Solution?	682
	Some Other Decisions	683
	Some Alternatives	685
C.	The Ethical Duty of Competence	685
D.	Continuing Legal Education	687
E.	Supervisory Responsibilities	687
	“I Don’t Want to Pry, But . . .”	687
F.	Unauthorized Practice of Law	690
	<i>Professional Adjusters, Inc. v. Tandon</i>	691
	The Troubled World of Unauthorized Practice	697
	Constitutional Limitations	698
	Quicken Family Lawyer Meets Texas UPL Statute and the Winner Is . . .	698

<b>Chapter XIII</b>	<b>Control of Quality: Remedies for Professional Failure</b>	<b>701</b>
A.	Malpractice and Breach of Fiduciary Duty	701
1.	Liability to Clients	704
	“When Sally Left Harry . . .”	704
	<i>Togstad v. Vesely, Otto, Miller &amp; Keefe</i>	707
	What Is the Required Standard of Care?	713
	Fraud and Misrepresentation	714
	Breach of Fiduciary Duties	716
	Is Sex with Clients a Breach of Fiduciary Duty?	717
	<i>Tante v. Herring</i>	717
2.	Third Parties as “Client-Equivalents”	719
3.	Vicarious Liability	721
B.	Proving Malpractice	722
1.	Use of Ethics Rules and Expert Testimony	722
	<i>Smith v. Haynsworth, Marion, McKay &amp; Geurard</i>	723
	Ethical Violations as a Basis for Reduction or Denial of Fees	726
	<i>Hendry v. Pelland</i>	726
	Fee Forfeiture and Disgorgement	727
2.	Causation and Defenses	728
	<i>Viner v. Sweet</i>	729
	Ruminations on the “But For” Test in Legal Malpractice	734
	Causation in Criminal Cases	737
	“Adkins v. Dixon”	737
	<i>Peeler v. Hughes &amp; Luce</i>	739
	Acquittal, Innocence, or Exoneration?	743
	Assigned Counsel	746
3.	Damages or Injury	747
	“Memorandum to the Court from the Chief Judge”	747
C.	Beyond Malpractice: Other Grounds for Attorney Liability to Clients and Third Parties	750
	“Death and Taxes (and Liability?)”	750
	<i>Petrillo v. Bachenberg</i>	752
	The Expanding Universe in Professional Liability	758
D.	Discipline	770
1.	Purposes of Discipline	770
2.	Sanctions	771
3.	Disciplinary Systems	773
4.	Acts Justifying Discipline	774
a.	Dishonest and Unlawful Conduct	774
	<i>In re Warhaftig</i>	774
	<i>In re Austern</i>	777
	Deceit, Dishonesty, Etcetera	780
b.	Neglect and Lack of Candor	783
c.	Sexual Relations with a Client	784
	<i>Matter of Tsoutsouris</i>	785
	Should Lawyers Be Forbidden to Have Sexual Relations with Clients?	787

d.	The Lawyer’s “Private” Life and Conduct Unrelated to Clients	790
e.	Racist and Sexist Conduct	792
	<i>Matter of Jordan Schiff</i>	792
	Close Questions?	797
f.	Failure to Report Another Lawyer’s Misconduct	799
	“Better Late than Never”	799
5.	Defenses	802
6.	Disciplinary Procedures	804
7.	Discipline in a Federal System	807
E.	Constitutional Protection in Criminal Cases	808
	<i>Strickland v. Washington</i>	811
	Inadequate Time to Prepare	816
	<i>United States v. Cronic</i>	816
	Some Reasons for Ineffectiveness Claims	818
	Morris v. Slappy: Effectiveness Does Not Include Rapport	820
	The Ineffectiveness Test in a System of Procedural Defaults	821
	An Ounce of Prevention?	821

**Chapter XIV      Control of Quality: Lay Participation in Law Business (and Law Firm Ancillary Services)      825**

	Legislative History	828
A.	Nonprofit Entities and Intermediaries	830
1.	Public Interest Organizations	830
	<i>NAACP v. Button</i>	831
	Maintenance, Barratry, Champerty, and Change: What Did <i>Button</i> Decide?	837
2.	Labor Unions	840
	<i>United Transportation Union v. State Bar of Michigan</i>	842
B.	For-Profit Enterprises	845
	“Can Viktor Be Our Partner?”	845
	Should We Let Nonlawyers Own Law Firms or Non-Law Firms Sell Legal Services to the Public?	845
	Litigation Funding Companies	847
	Multidisciplinary Practice (MDP)	849
	Reciprocal Referral Agreements	851
C.	May a Law Firm Own an Ancillary Business?	852
	The Rise and Fall and Humble Return of Model Rule 5.7	853

**Part Five**

---



---

**FIRST AMENDMENT RIGHTS OF LAWYERS AND JUDICIAL CANDIDATES      855**

**Chapter XV      Free Speech Rights of Lawyers and Judicial Candidates      857**

A.	Public Comment About Pending Cases	859
	“ <i>What Can I Say?</i> ”	859

<i>Gentile v. State Bar of Nevada</i>	864
Questions About <i>Gentile</i>	880
Defamation Claims	881
B. Public Comment About Judges and Courts	883
1. Criticizing the Administration of Justice	883
2. Criticizing Particular Judges	885
<i>Matter of Holtzman</i>	886
Questions About <i>Holtzman</i>	889
Other Examples of Lawyers Criticizing Judges and Justice	889
C. Judicial Campaign Speech	892
“I Got These Questionnaires”	892
<i>Republican Party of Minnesota v. White</i>	893
<b>Chapter XVI      Marketing Legal Services</b>	<b>911</b>
“I’m Back on My Feet”	911
A. Defining the Borders: <i>Bates</i> and <i>Ohralik</i>	913
<i>Ohralik v. Ohio State Bar Assn.</i>	916
A Prophylactic Rule	920
B. Defining the Center: <i>Zauderer</i> and <i>Shapero</i>	921
1. Targeted Advertisements	922
<i>Zauderer v. Office of Disciplinary Counsel</i>	922
2. Targeted Mail	928
<i>Shapero v. Kentucky Bar Assn.</i>	929
The Response to <i>Shapero</i>	935
C. Defining the Methodology	937
How Does the Court Know Things?	937
Professionalism and Money	939
D. Solicitation by Public Interest and Class Action Lawyers	941
“I Need to Make Contact”	941
<i>In re Primus</i>	942
Communication with Class Members	948
<b>Table of Cases</b>	<b>951</b>
<b>Table of Code, Rules, and Restatement Provisions</b>	<b>965</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>969</b>