
Contents

| | |
|------------------------------|-------|
| <i>Preface</i> | xxi |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | xxiii |

CHAPTER 1

Insurance, Law, and Society

| | | |
|------|---|----|
| I. | Risk and Insurance 101 | 2 |
| II. | Beyond Risk Spreading—Part One..... | 4 |
| | <i>D.R. Jacques, Society on the Basis of Mutual Life Insurance...</i> | 8 |
| | Questions..... | 9 |
| III. | Beyond Risk Spreading—Part Two..... | 9 |
| IV. | (Way) Beyond Risk Spreading—Insurance and Social Responsibility..... | 12 |
| | A. Insurance and Accountability..... | 15 |
| | B. Insurance and Trustworthiness..... | 16 |
| | C. Insurance and Causation | 17 |
| | D. Insurance and Freedom..... | 20 |
| | E. Insurance and Solidarity | 21 |
| V. | Insurance Law..... | 22 |
| | <i>Robert H. Jerry II, Insurance</i> | 22 |
| | An AIDS and Insurance Problem..... | 26 |

CHAPTER 2

Contract Law Foundations

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| I. | Introduction..... | 29 |
| II. | Insurance Contract Interpretation | 30 |
| | <i>Gaunt v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co.</i> | 30 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 34 |
| | <i>World Trade Center Properties v. Travelers Indemnity Co.</i> ... | 35 |

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| | Notes and Questions..... | 39 |
| | <i>C&J Fertilizer, Inc. v. Allied Mutual Insurance</i> | 42 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 51 |
| | The Hurricane Andrew Code Upgrade Problem..... | 56 |
| III. | Waiver and Estoppel | 57 |
| | <i>Darner Motor Sales, Inc. v. Universal Underwriters</i> <i>Insurance Co.</i> | 58 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 66 |
| | <i>Bible v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co.</i> | 68 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 69 |
| | <i>Jenkins v. Indemnity Insurance Co. of North America</i> | 70 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 73 |
| | The <i>Roseth</i> Problem | 74 |
| IV. | The Role of Insurance Intermediaries..... | 74 |
| | <i>Economy Fire & Casualty Co. v. Bassett</i> | 75 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 79 |
| V. | Misrepresentation..... | 79 |
| | The Auto Insurance Misrepresentation Problem | 81 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 82 |
| | <i>Pum v. Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corp.</i> | 84 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 89 |
| VI. | Disproportionate Forfeiture | 91 |
| | <i>Aetna Casualty & Surety Co. v. Murphy</i> | 92 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 97 |
| | WeCare’s Problem..... | 99 |
| VII. | Damages..... | 100 |
| | <i>Kewin v. Massachusetts Mutual Life Insurance Co.</i> | 101 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 105 |
| A. | The Tort of Insurance Bad Faith | 107 |
| | <i>Anderson v. Continental Insurance Co.</i> | 107 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 111 |
| B. | Punitive Damages | 114 |
| | <i>Hangarter v. Provident Life & Accident Insurance Co.</i> | 114 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 123 |

CHAPTER 3

First-Party Insurance: Illustrative Lines and Issues

| | | |
|----|--|-----|
| I. | Health Insurance | 129 |
| A. | ERISA..... | 130 |
| | 1. Express Preemption Under ERISA §514..... | 130 |
| | 2. “Complete” Preemption Under ERISA §502(a) | 132 |
| | <i>Andrews-Clarke v. Travelers Insurance Co.</i> | 134 |
| | 3. A Note on ERISA Remedies..... | 137 |
| | ERISA Preemption Problems | 138 |
| | 4. The Scope of ERISA’s Preemptive Shield..... | 138 |

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| | <i>Aetna Health Inc. v. Davila</i> | 140 |
| | Notes and Questions | 147 |
| B. | Drawing the Medical Necessity Line | 149 |
| | <i>Pirozzi v. Blue Cross-Blue Shield of Virginia</i> | 150 |
| | Notes and Questions | 156 |
| | Problem: The End of Mammography? | 160 |
| C. | The Mental/Physical Distinction | 161 |
| | <i>Arkansas Blue Cross & Blue Shield, Inc. v. John Doe</i> | 161 |
| | Notes and Questions | 164 |
| | The Autism Treatment Problem | 167 |
| D. | Preexisting Condition Exclusions | 168 |
| | <i>Hardester v. Lincoln National Life Insurance Co.</i> | 168 |
| | Notes and Questions | 172 |
| | The Fibromatosis Preexisting Condition Problem | 175 |
| | A Note on COBRA Coverage | 176 |
| II. | Disability Insurance | 177 |
| A. | The Meaning of Disability | 177 |
| | 1. Social Security | 177 |
| | 2. Workers' Compensation | 177 |
| | 3. Americans with Disabilities Act | 177 |
| | <i>Prudence Life Insurance Co. v. Wooley</i> | 178 |
| | Notes and Questions | 180 |
| | <i>Heller v. Equitable Life Assurance Society</i> | 182 |
| | Notes and Questions | 185 |
| B. | Coordination of Benefits | 188 |
| | <i>Cody v. Connecticut General Life Insurance Co.</i> | 188 |
| | Notes and Questions | 191 |
| | MegaMutual's Human Resources Problem | 193 |
| C. | ERISA Litigation: "Toto, We're Not in Kansas Anymore" | 194 |
| | <i>Fought v. UNUM Life Insurance Co. of America</i> | 195 |
| | Notes and Questions | 206 |
| | <i>John H. Langbein, Trust Law as Regulatory Law: The UNUM/Provident Scandal and Judicial Review of Benefit Denials Under ERISA</i> | 208 |
| III. | Life Insurance | 218 |
| A. | Incontestability | 219 |
| | <i>Metropolitan Life Insurance Co. v. Conway</i> | 219 |
| | Notes and Questions | 221 |
| | <i>Allstate Life Insurance Co. v. Miller</i> | 222 |
| | Notes and Questions | 225 |
| | Fortress's Incontestability Problem | 228 |
| B. | Life Insurance Tax Benefits | 229 |
| | <i>Kyle Logue, The Current Life Insurance Crisis: How the Law Should Respond</i> | 230 |
| C. | Insurable Interest | 233 |
| | <i>Grigsby v. Russell</i> | 233 |
| | Notes and Questions | 235 |
| | <i>Stephan R. Leimberg & Albert E. Gibbons, COLI, BOLI, TOLI and Insurable Interests</i> | 238 |
| | Notes and Questions | 240 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| | <i>Mayo v. Hartford Life Insurance Co.</i> | 242 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 245 |
| | Mighty Widgit’s Insurable Interest Problem | 246 |
| IV. | Property Insurance..... | 249 |
| | A. The All Risk Concept, Causation, and Excluded Losses..... | 250 |
| | <i>State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. v. Bongen</i> | 277 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 280 |
| | Causation Problems | 282 |
| | <i>Buente v. Allstate Property & Casualty Insurance Co.</i> | 284 |
| | <i>Tuepker v. State Farm Fire & Casualty Co.</i> | 285 |
| | <i>Leonard v. Nationwide Mutual Insurance Co.</i> | 289 |
| | <i>Broussard v. State Farm Fire & Casualty Co.</i> | 297 |
| | <i>Broussard v. State Farm Fire & Casualty Co.</i> | 300 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 303 |
| | B. Valuation..... | 306 |
| | <i>McAnarney v. Newark Fire Insurance Co.</i> | 306 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 310 |
| | A Note on Valuation and Insurance Redlining..... | 313 |
| | The Auto Valuation Problem | 314 |
| | C. Business Interruption Insurance | 314 |
| | <i>Zurich American Insurance Co. v. ABM Industries, Inc.</i> .. | 315 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 320 |
| | D. Innocent Co-Insureds..... | 322 |
| | <i>Watson v. United States Services Automobile Association</i> ... | 322 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 327 |
| | SITA’s Innocent Co-Insured Problem | 331 |
| V. | Subrogation | 331 |
| | <i>Rimes v. State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co.</i> | 333 |
| | <i>Ludwig v. Farm Bureau Mutual Insurance Co.</i> | 337 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 341 |
| | A. Some Technical Aspects of Subrogation Law | 345 |
| | B. The Subrogation Tetrahedron | 346 |
| | A Tort Reform Problem Illustrating the Relationship Between Subrogation and the Collateral Source Rule | 350 |

CHAPTER 4

Liability Insurance

| | | |
|----|--|-----|
| I. | General Liability Insurance | 353 |
| | A. Understanding the Insuring Agreement..... | 354 |
| | 1. Trigger of Coverage..... | 355 |
| | <i>Owens-Illinois, Inc. v. United Insurance Co.</i> | 355 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 377 |
| | A Note on the “Scope” or “Allocation” of Coverage Issue | 379 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| | <i>Eljer Manufacturing Inc. v. Liberty Mutual Insurance Co.</i> | 382 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 387 |
| | Claims-Made vs. Occurrence | 388 |
| | Problem: The Case Against Dr. Bill | 390 |
| | Problem: Dr. Bill’s Choice..... | 390 |
| 2. | What Is Bodily Injury? | 393 |
| | <i>Voorhees v. Preferred Mutual Insurance Co.</i> | 393 |
| | <i>SL Industries, Inc. v. American Motorists Insurance Co.</i> ... | 394 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 396 |
| 3. | The Application of Limits and Deductibles: | |
| | The “Number of Occurrences” Issue | 397 |
| | <i>Transport Insurance Co. v. Lee Way Motor Freight, Inc.</i> | 398 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 402 |
| B. | Environmental Liability Insurance Coverage Issues | 403 |
| | Environmental Trigger Problems | 404 |
| | <i>Peace v. Northwestern National Insurance Co.</i> | 404 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 411 |
| | Environmental Coverage Problem..... | 412 |
| C. | The Problem of Intentional Harm..... | 413 |
| 1. | Defining “Expected or Intended” | 413 |
| | <i>Carter Lake v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Co.</i> | 414 |
| | <i>Physicians Insurance Co. of Ohio v. Swanson</i> | 418 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 426 |
| 2. | The Public Policy Issue | 427 |
| | <i>Ambassador Insurance Co. v. Montes</i> | 428 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 435 |
| 3. | “Intent” at the Borders of Tort Law, Criminal Law, and Insurance Law | 438 |
| | <i>State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. v. Wicka</i> | 438 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 441 |
| 4. | The Criminal Acts Exclusion | 442 |
| | <i>Daniel C. Eidsmore & Pamela K. Edwards, Home Liability Coverage: Does the Criminal Acts Exclusion Work Where the “Expected or Intended” Exclusion Failed?</i> | 442 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 443 |
| | <i>Allstate Insurance Co. v. Peasley</i> | 444 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 449 |
| | The Prosecutor’s Problem | 451 |
| II. | Automobile Liability Insurance | 451 |
| A. | The Omnibus Clause..... | 453 |
| | <i>Odolecki v. Hartford Accident & Indemnity Co.</i> | 453 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 456 |
| B. | The Family Member Exclusion | 457 |
| | <i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Ballard</i> | 457 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 463 |
| C. | Arising Out of the Use of an Automobile..... | 464 |

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| | <i>Farm Bureau Mutual Insurance Co. v. Evans</i> | 464 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 466 |
| D. | Market Segmentation Exclusions | 466 |
| | <i>State Farm Fire & Casualty v. Camara</i> | 467 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 470 |
| | Guns and Trucks and Other Problems at the Auto-General Liability Border..... | 470 |
| III. | Professional Liability Insurance..... | 471 |
| A. | The Definition of “Professional Services” | 471 |
| | <i>Medical Records Associates, Inc. v. American Empire Surplus Lines Insurance Co.</i> | 471 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 476 |
| | <i>Guaranty National Insurance Co. v. North River Insurance Co.</i> | 479 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 483 |
| | <i>Woo v. Fireman’s Fund Insurance Co.</i> | 484 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 492 |
| B. | Directors’ and Officers’ Liability Insurance | 493 |
| | <i>Flinkote Co. v. Lloyd’s Underwriters</i> | 494 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 499 |
| | <i>Level 3 Communications, Inc. v. Federal Insurance Co.</i> | 501 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 503 |
| C. | Late Notice Under a Claims-made Policy..... | 504 |
| | <i>Gulf Insurance Co. v. Dolan, Fertig & Curtis</i> | 504 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 508 |
| | <i>Root v. American Equity Specialty Insurance Co.</i> | 509 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 518 |
| | Marcella DeMoyné’s Late Notice Problem | 519 |

CHAPTER 5

Liability Insurance Relationship Issues

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| I. | The Duty to Defend | 524 |
| A. | The Basic Duty | 525 |
| | <i>Gray v. Zurich Insurance Co.</i> | 525 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 531 |
| | <i>Adam Scales, Can This Pig Fly? How a Dentist Assaulted a Patient and Made a Million Dollars</i> ... | 534 |
| B. | Terminating the Duty to Defend | 538 |
| | <i>Employers’ Fire Insurance v. Beals</i> | 538 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 543 |
| | Problem: Carol Green’s Fall..... | 546 |
| II. | The Duty to Settle | 547 |
| | <i>Comunale v. Traders & General Insurance Co.</i> | 548 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 551 |
| | A Note on Determining a “Reasonable” Settlement Offer..... | 553 |

Problem: BMC v. Trustworthy 554
PPG Industries, Inc. v. Transamerica Insurance Co. 555
 Notes and Questions..... 560
The Birth Center v. St. Paul Cos., Inc. 561
 Notes and Questions..... 565
 III. The Liability Insurer’s Duty to Tort Victims 565
 Clegg v. Butler 566
 Note 571
 Ben A. Patsy, et al. v. Family Insurance Bureau 571
 Notes and Questions..... 576
 Moradi-Shalal v. Fireman’s Fund Insurance Co. 576
 Notes and Questions..... 584
 Senator Zhang’s Problem 586
 IV. Liability Insurance Conflicts of Interest..... 586
 A. Visualizing the Liability Insurance Relationship:
 Triangles and Tetrahedrons 587
 B. Pattern Conflict Cases 589
 1. Dollar Limits..... 589
 2. Verbal Limits on the Covered Harm to Victims..... 591
 3. Verbal Limits on the Covered Harm to Policyholders..... 591
 4. Verbal Limits Relating to Policyholders’ Obligations 592
 C. The Defense Lawyer’s Responsibilities in a Conflict Case..... 592
 Restatement (Third) of the Law Governing Lawyers 592
 Notes and Questions..... 594
 Conflicts Problems 596
 Steele v. The Hartford Fire Insurance Co. 598
 Notes and Questions..... 606
 V. The Duty to Cooperate 606
 A. The Basic Duty 607
 Wildrick v. North River Insurance Co. 607
 Notes and Questions..... 613
 B. Settlements and the Duty to Cooperate..... 615
 Miller v. Shugart..... 615
 Notes and Questions..... 619
 State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. v. Gandy 621
 Notes and Questions..... 627
 VI. The Impact of Liability Insurance on Tort Law 627

CHAPTER 6

Insurance Regulation

I. Overview 637
 A. Functional Divisions of Insurance Regulation 637
 B. Theoretical Justifications..... 641
 1. Information Problems 641
 2. Externalities 642
 3. Opportunism 642
 4. Egalitarian or Distributional Concerns 642

| | | |
|------|--|-----|
| II. | Marking the Boundaries of State and Federal Authority..... | 643 |
| A. | What Is Insurance Under State Law?..... | 643 |
| | <i>Griffin Systems, Inc. v. Ohio Department of Insurance</i> | 644 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 649 |
| | Problems in State Jurisdiction over “Insurance” Activity..... | 650 |
| B. | Insurance Federalism | 651 |
| | <i>Susan Randall, Insurance Regulation in the United States: Regulatory Federalism and the National Association of Insurance Commissioners</i> | 652 |
| | <i>Securities & Exchange Commission v. Variable Annuity Life Insurance Co.</i> | 658 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 662 |
| | Semi-Annie’s Variable Annuity Problem..... | 663 |
| | <i>Securities & Exchange Commission v. National Securities, Inc.</i> | 664 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 666 |
| | <i>Weiss v. First UNUM Life Insurance Co.</i> | 667 |
| | <i>Hartford Fire Insurance Co. v. California</i> | 675 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 683 |
| III. | Topics in Substantive Insurance Regulation..... | 683 |
| A. | Insurance Guaranty Funds..... | 683 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 687 |
| | <i>New Mexico Life Insurance Guaranty Association v. Moore</i> | 690 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 693 |
| | Problem: Guaranty Funds for Risk-Bearing Health Care Providers? | 693 |
| B. | Residual Market Mechanisms | 693 |
| | <i>Ruth Gastel, ed., Residual Markets</i> | 694 |
| | <i>State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. New Jersey</i> | 698 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 703 |
| | Legal Malpractice Residual Markets Problem..... | 704 |
| C. | Insurance Risk Classification | 705 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 708 |
| | 1. Competing Visions of “Fair Discrimination” | 709 |
| | 2. Risk-Based Pricing and Beyond: Legal Grounds for Antidiscrimination Litigation..... | 710 |
| | a. The Model Unfair Trade Practices Act..... | 710 |
| | b. The Fair Housing Act | 711 |
| | c. Section 1981 of the Civil Rights Act of 1866..... | 712 |
| | d. Title VII of the Civil Rights Act..... | 712 |
| | <i>Telles v. Commissioner of Insurance</i> | 713 |
| | Notes and Questions..... | 715 |
| | Risk Classification Problem | 719 |
| | <i>Table of Cases</i> | 723 |
| | <i>Table of Authorities</i> | 731 |
| | <i>Index</i> | 739 |